The Sins of Their Fathers Manuscript Evaluation

Dear Tiffany,

It's been so fun working on this project for you! I told my husband a while ago that I love *Pride* and *Prejudice* and I love fanfiction, so you're like a dream client. I know you're really excited to see the feedback I've got in store for you, so let's dive in.

Chapter by chapter, this story is really enjoyable and easy to binge-read. My biggest concern is that the story as a whole doesn't quite work cohesively. The majority of this manuscript evaluation will focus on how the themes and premise of this story are so promising but get lost in the way the structure and plot were handled. And since the plot is heavily driven by various character arcs, I'll also take a lot of time to talk about the various characters and how their arcs were or weren't satisfying as the plot progressed. After that, we'll talk about a few smaller details such as pacing, tone, and historical accuracy to top it all off.

But before we dive into all of that, I want to make sure we talk about a lot of the moments that worked really, really well and drew me in emotionally or really engaged me as a reader. Hopefully this will confirm that some of the things you were trying to accomplish worked just the way you wanted them to!

First, I wanted to tell you about the moments when I reacted emotionally to what the characters were doing on the page. I remember that moment when Mr. Bennet met young Collins for the first time and wasn't sure how to comfort the scared little boy. And Collins was just so honest asking about if he would be allowed to read, so when Mr. Bennet said, "Then I shall read with you," my heart seriously filled with joy and warmth to see Collins so touched by that simple kindness. It was a perfect bonding moment between them!

Another moment that hit me emotionally was at the end of Chapter 5 when I was putting the pieces together about how abusive Bingley Sr. was and what he wanted to do to Georgiana. Part of me wanted to hit Darcy over the head for not seeing it as clearly as I did (although I can't really blame him either), but the rest of me was just *filled* with dread wondering if Georgiana would be okay. Great emotion there!

There were a few other small moments that really made me smile. For instance, I loved seeing Charlotte try so hard to get dance partners in Chapter 7. It seemed really on point for her! And in Chapter 13 when Lizzy sees Darcy at Hunsford and thinks, "No! Surely Providence would not be so cruel," I literally laughed out loud. Her dread was just hilarious. I also chuckled a little when Lizzy and Darcy referenced the convenience of phones in the future in Chapter 21.

Another moment I really appreciated was when Caroline and Lizzy talked about postpartum depression and related mental changes during pregnancy. I thought you did a really excellent job of showing that they didn't really understand what was going on in these cases but that they still had compassion about it and recognized that it was a reality a lot of women go through. It just felt like the perfect balance of a realistic historical understanding and a modern day, more compassionate understanding. I like that this story is trying to bring out some of the hard truths and trials about life and have a conversation about how we deal with these issues.

I also loved all the tension that led up to Lizzy hoping to reunite with Darcy at Netherfield. That line when Darcy wasn't there was almost crushing! I think you were really effective in bringing out Lizzy's anticipation and building up to the moment when they finally saw each other again.

Finally, I'd just like to say that some of the twists in the story were really interesting to me and kept me engaged. For instance, I loved seeing how Collins influenced Mrs. Bennet to be a little calmer. His generosity in offering to take care of all five of his sisters however long he might need to was so sweet and really made him a likable character who I was excited to follow. I also liked seeing some small twists in Darcy and Lizzy's story. For instance, the fact that Lizzy suspected Darcy of stealing the calling card in Chapter 12 felt like a fresh take on the way she judges him.

Anyway, hopefully my reactions here give you a good view of what parts of the story were some of the most engaging and effective. I know a lot of reviewers on Fanfiction.net just say things like "this was so good!" every chapter they review, which is nice but also not constructive. It's important that you see your strengths as a writer so you can perpetuate those elements in your writing! However, I should add this caveat: Don't be afraid to take out or change these moments if you need to as you revise. I can't say for sure how extensively you'll want to revise after reading my feedback, but even if you end up needing to change some of these moments, I'm confident you'll be able to create similar emotional moments for your readers again.

Structure and Plot

There's a lot about this story that draws readers in right away. For instance, I think the prologue is a great hook that helps readers sympathize with Collins. I saw a number of your reviewers say that they'd been looking for a story with just this sort of premise and were so excited to see what you had in store for them! Unfortunately, there are a few promises made in this premise that don't really get the payoff they should, and part of that has to do with how the story is pitched and part of that has to do with how the prologue and first few chapters are structured. This later affects how satisfying the plot is as it unfolds throughout the rest of the manuscript. So, let's dive in and talk about how the promises, progress, and payoffs work with the structure and plot.

Structure: Promise, Progress, and Payoff

First, let's just overview what I mean by "promise, progress, and payoff" so we're on the same page. (If you want more detail/examples than what I'll cover, my favorite author Brandon Sanderson has a great lecture about it you can watch here.) Essentially, to make a plot engaging for a reader, we start with some sort of promise about what the protagonist wants or needs. For instance (going super basic here), maybe a protagonist needs to fight through ten ninjas to rescue a loved one. We then keep the reader engaged by showing the progress of the protagonist potentially reaching their loved one by showing them take down each ninja—and the reader gets excited as the total count gets closer and closer to ten. Finally, the payoff comes when the protagonist either does or doesn't reach the goal, hopefully also growing their character in some way as a result.

So, how do we see the promise, progress, and payoff unfolding in *The Sins of Their Fathers*? The promise in the beginning is that William Collins is going to become an important part of the Bennet family and find happiness and safety in a new father figure, overcoming the pain and trauma he's experienced from his birth father's sins. The progress should come from seeing Collins develop relationships with his new family, influencing their lives (for better or worse), and making steps in overcoming his childhood trauma. The payoff should be the moment when Collins fully gets what he needs from his family relationships and friendships and overcomes the trauma holding him back from his full potential. However, this isn't the actual progress and payoff we see in the story. Instead, the book largely focuses on Darcy and Lizzy inevitably getting together under somewhat different circumstances than the original *Pride and Prejudice*. Can you see how this progression of the plot can be a little unsatisfying, even if the majority of your readers are still excited to see Darcy and Lizzy get together?

Like I said, part of the reason the promise is set up this way is because of the way the story is pitched. Of course, with only so many words allowed in a Fanfiction summary, it makes sense that it's hard to talk about more than Collins going to live with the Bennets and an appropriate trigger warning. Summarizing your book more completely when you're ready to publish it is an easy fix! What will take a lot more thought and revision will be establishing the right promises in the beginning of your story and developing the progress and payoffs accordingly. How you decide to revise will all depend on where you want the story to go and what themes you especially want to focus on (more on that in another section). For now, I'll give you an idea of what I think will be most effective.

I've already explained how Collins' initial promise in the prologue doesn't get quite the progress and payoff it's due, but there are a few other character arcs that have a similar problem. For instance, Darcy and Wickham both have a twist early on in their lives too regarding their fathers, but most of these issues are resolved within a few chapters. Additionally, some readers may be uncertain about how to truly perceive this change in Darcy and Wickham's backstory. Because there's a singular focus on Collins in the prologue, it's difficult to tell if Darcy and Wickham's situation is meant to somehow be affected by Collins' change in fate (maybe related to that

theory that a change as small as a butterfly's wingbeat could create a hurricane?) or if their backstory was just meant to be set up later than Collins' was.

We have a similar problem with the Bingleys. Although one could argue that Caroline Bingley's trauma could have been hidden within the original canon, we know giving Bingley Sr. a terrible sin as well is another change from the original story. However, it comes up in the plotline without warning or any of the set up that Collins, Darcy, or Wickham got. Again, we're left to wonder if this is a change brought on by the universe being adjusted slightly or if it just wasn't explained in the beginning (although I will say the progress and payoff of Caroline Bingley's arc is much more developed than any of the other characters, so great job on that).

I suggest you rewrite/restructure the prologue to be a series of three to four scenes establishing the root of the changes in each of these characters—Collins, Darcy, Wickham, and the Bingleys. By giving the readers an overview of the four fathers whose sins must be overcome in the end, they'll be excited to see how each character grows and changes the relationships around them. The rest of the story will need some refocusing and revising as well, I think, but I'll dive into that by talking a little more specifically about the plot and some issues that came up there.

Plot

I mentioned before that *The Sins of Their Fathers* opens with a promise of William Collins being the main character but quickly turns into a typical retelling of Darcy and Lizzy inevitably getting together with only mildly different circumstances. Some of your readers definitely don't care about that inconsistency, but for many others, it's disappointing to see characters like Collins and Wickham become so likable and interesting to follow only to have them disappear for more than half of the story.

Personally, I was disappointed that I never got to see Collins grow up with the Bennets and develop relationships with his sisters. I felt cheated that I didn't get to see him and Mary fall in love. Later, Collins developed a friendship with Darcy, Bingley, and Wickham that I didn't actually see develop, making the relationships feel forced and unrealistic. And because I was so disappointed that I didn't get to truly see these changes slowly unraveling and changing events, I (to be frank) got a little annoyed when so many of the same old iconic scenes from *Pride and Prejudice* showed up in very similar ways to the original (such as Caroline inviting Lizzy to take a turn about the room).

Here, I must admit that I'm not as familiar with the *Pride and Prejudice* fandom as you likely are, so I don't know how many other readers tend to get bored of variations that promise to be really different and interesting but don't actually end up changing the story too much. And it's not that I think readers are looking for anything radical like *not* letting Darcy and Lizzy get together! But what we've really missed from this story is seeing how Collins, Darcy, Wickham, and the Bingleys really change the story around them because of their need to overcome their fathers' sins. I was dying to see what influence Collins might have to make Darcy and Lizzy's love story

different (there was a little influence, but not nearly enough). I think some of the iconic lines or scenes can definitely still work into the story, but they're going to be the most satisfying when they come about in very different and clever ways related to the new decisions these characters are making.

There's a lot to think about in how you're going to want to rework the plot, but I think the notes I have on the characters themselves will help you get more of an idea of some things that might be missing or need more emphasis. But before I get there, I want to point out one more thing related to the plot that didn't sit right. This is much more specific, but Bingley Sr.'s death in Chapter 6 seemed far too convenient to me. I know killing him off is a simple way to take care of a truly detestable character and allow the other Bingleys to get away for some healing and growth, but the way that he died had me rolling my eyes a little. Maybe all this scene needed was a different tone to make it work right, but you could also consider having him die another way or maybe not dying right away, which could definitely influence how the Bingleys develop.

Characters and Relationships

There's a *lot* I want to say about all the character portrayals, arcs, and relationships. You'll find that quite a bit of what I'll discuss here goes hand in hand with the things I just mentioned with the structure and plot, as these characters should be driving the plot with their decisions and development.

Darcy

To be honest, Darcy was my least favorite character in the story. It felt like there were literally two Darcys being written, and one of them was only hanging around to make Lizzy hate him until she read his letter.

The first Darcy had center stage in the first seven chapters. He was hard working, considerate, and loyal, and he didn't seem to care at all about anyone else's station in life compared to his own. Then suddenly, in Chapter 7, he completely flips and presents himself as someone so proud, cold, and removed, and he *very* much disparages those below him in station. I remember feeling a complete shock when I started reading Austen's own dialogue when Darcy slights Lizzy at the ball. He felt completely out of character compared to the Darcy I'd seen in the previous chapters.

This aspect of Darcy's double nature became hypocritical the further we got into the story. Darcy assured Wickham over and over that his station didn't keep him from being Darcy's brother in (quite possibly) every sense of the word. Darcy didn't hesitate to strike up a friendship with Bingley despite his roots in trade. And although Darcy and Collins weren't exactly best friends, there was no sign of Darcy having anything but respect for him despite his lower status, and Darcy certainly never seemed aloof around him. So why does all that kindness and respect

for people of lower classes go out the window when Darcy confronts the rest of the Bennet family? Why does Lizzy's station still come up as an issue in his proposal?

I think the root of this problem is that the Darcy who starts out before Chapter 7 is already acting too much like the Darcy we want to see at the end of the story. We need to see more of his pride and other weaknesses involved in these early chapters so we really have room to see him grow and change. For the most part, Darcy didn't really seem to have a character arc at all. Once he "flipped" in Chapter 7 and became rude-Darcy, the only "development" that came later was Darcy acting apologetic about it all to Elizabeth. Yet he didn't really *do* anything to redeem himself and become better.

Additionally, what little of an arc Darcy had had nothing to do with the original conflict set up in the first few chapters about his father. He essentially just promised to not drink alcohol, and then he never did, and that was that. I'd love to see Darcy struggling with more of the essence of what his father struggled with and learning from his own struggle. Maybe that comes down to indulgences of any kind or losing control in a moment of stress or despair. Whatever it is, how can Darcy truly have his own character arc that shows how he overcomes the scars left behind by his father's sins?

Wickham

Overall, I really liked the premise of the change in Wickham's backstory and how he became such an honorable man because of it. Wickham is initially such a charming character in the original, so it's exciting to potentially see that charm come out in a good way! But, like I said, it's really disappointing when Wickham essentially disappears for half of the book and doesn't have any real character development after approximately Chapter 3. Here's a few thoughts about how to make his character more satisfying to follow throughout the story.

First, we know that Wickham has a really interesting conflict in the beginning. He doesn't know who his actual father is (although he's quite lucky that the two main possibilities are rather upstanding men). I felt that perhaps Wickham should be angrier or take a little more time to really process the fact that he could have been raised as a Darcy rather than a Wickham. This isn't just to add conflict or drama. Most people who don't know who their birth parents are have a lot of trauma to deal with in real life! They have question after question about who their real family is, why they weren't raised by both biological parents, if their parents really loved them, and all sorts of other hard questions. Granted, Wickham does know who his biological mother is, but simply not knowing whether Wickham Sr. or Darcy Sr. is his father should be enough to bring up a lot of identity issues that could manifest in many different ways. (If you want some inspiration for the kinds of emotions and questions Wickham might struggle with, watch some episodes of Relative Race on BYUTV! The first few seasons don't have a ton of adoptees searching for immediate family, but around season 4 there's a lot more of that and there are some incredible stories.)

I think you tried to address this with how Wickham acted at school, but it all felt sort of like a tangent after it was resolved. I'd love to see Wickham work on coming to terms with himself and his identity throughout the whole story—which would be a great way to keep him from just disappearing and being forgotten about.

Another way we can involve Wickham more throughout the story is using him as a little more of a bridge between Darcy, Bingley, and Collins. Because Darcy trusts Wickham as a brother, it makes sense that Wickham can convince him to open up and start building trust and friendship with Bingley and Collins. This could be even more important on Bingley's side of things when he has to deal with such sensitive matters surrounding his father and sister. Bingley and Darcy seem to be the ones working together most when all that drama happens, but it makes more sense for Bingley to reach out to Wickham first as a closer friend than Darcy at that point.

Additionally, I'm surprised Wickham and Lizzy didn't seem to have any sort of relationship throughout the entire story. They hardly spoke two words to each other! But in the original story, they got along really well at first—Lizzy basically had a crush on him. If Wickham still has his charming personality, Lizzy should be drawn to him even if she doesn't fall in love with him. I'd love to see what sort of influence Wickham has on her and her relationship with Darcy.

Collins

Collins really shone as a protagonist in the prologue and second chapter of the story. I also really enjoyed seeing a little of his time at school. Him praying for a kind roommate was so on point! However, I still wanted a little more depth from Collins. Like I've said before, I wanted to see him grow up with the Bennets, fall in love with Mary, and grow into a compassionate man who didn't have to be a pastor but wanted to anyway because he wanted to help people. There's so much potential for him to face all sorts of conflict as the world keeps throwing tragedies and trauma at him when all he wants is to bring others the peace, safety, and joy that comes from his faith. It was disappointing to have the promised main character become a side character who hardly did anything. Collins doesn't have to become *the* main character of the story, but like Wickham, he should certainly play a larger role and not fade into the background.

Bingley

From what I can tell of the *Pride and Prejudice* fandom, they get pretty excited when Bingley's character gets a little spine and becomes more than just the guy who was convinced to reject the love of his life. And there is *so* much potential for Bingley in this story that doesn't get taken advantage of at all!

Bingley finds out a pretty devastating truth about his father's incest. Like, I can't imagine how horrific that would be! Yet Bingley hardly seems to change at all because of this revelation. He kind of just goes along, the same old cheerful Bingley who falls head over heels for Jane. But what kind of impact could that revelation really have on someone? Might Bingley lose some trust in the other men around him? Might he be overly cautious about making unwelcome

advances on other women? There's all sorts of psychological repercussions that could come from learning your father kept something so atrocious a secret from you in your own home. It would be amazing to see Bingley struggle with this trauma, overcome it, and become someone better because of it. I think this could really impact his relationship with his sisters, Jane, and with his friends Darcy, Wickham, and Collins—all in potentially very satisfying and emotional ways!

Another thing to consider about the realities of Bingley having a father like this is that Bingley Sr. could have had a more negative influence on Bingley's honorable qualities. Predators like this groom their victims so that they think it's normal or that they can't fight back, and it makes sense that Bingley Sr. might have tried to groom Bingley Jr. to sort of turn a blind eye so he could have more control over his children. I'm not saying that Bingley has to be raised to take advantage of women, but I also can't imagine his father actively teaching him to respect women. It'll be important to think about how much influence Bingley Sr. really had on Bingley's character growing up and what that could mean for the rest of the story as well.

Caroline

Speaking of the Bingleys, let's talk about Caroline! I think there was a lot of potential here. Caroline definitely had some difficult trauma and pain to work through, and it was cool to see how she overcame so much of it. However, sometimes I felt like I really didn't understand her character. I could see that this Caroline was nicer than the original Caroline, but then there were so many moments when her original pride and haughtiness popped back up. I know you were trying to make that stem from her trauma, but it didn't really feel connected to me and came across more like we were getting the same Caroline from the books but with a different backstory . . . a backstory that I think should have led to a more different Caroline.

There was a great line near the end when Lizzy realized all that Caroline had gone through and that she was really putting up walls around herself most of the time, not just being a brat. The problem was that even after Lizzy thought that, when I looked back on things, it didn't seem like Caroline was really putting up walls. It still felt like she was just being a brat!

I'd also like to point out one moment in particular when Caroline seemed rather out of character in Chapter 23. Here, she's a little frank with Lizzy in assuring her of her happiness in her sexual relationship with Wickham. That seems like an extremely forward conversation to have, even when Lizzy has become a better friend and is embracing her as a sister. It also seems a little odd to say that she knows Lizzy would be worried about her in this way when in reality it's only the readers who are actually concerned about this. If Lizzy does wonder about how Caroline and Wickham get on, it's probably more because she's being nosy than being thoughtful.

One thing to consider to try to get around these issues is to allow Caroline a few moments of her own POV. And specifically for this last issue I pointed out, another option is to wait to resolve this for the readers in the epilogue when Lizzy can easily claim that their relationship as sisters is much closer after so many years and that they've been able to have appropriate conversations about intimacy because of it.

Lizzy

Overall, I don't have too much to complain about with Lizzy's arc, but to be fair, she largely followed her original arc anyway. On the bright side, we know the readers will enjoy Lizzy's storyline pretty easily because we know it works. On the downside, some readers may be dissatisfied with how similar her character turns out at the end. (Like I mentioned before, you know your audience a little better than I do, so use your best judgment here.) I think you could really go either way with how you want to revise her character. Depending on how much you might change about the gentlemen's interactions with her (like Collins or Wickham), she could definitely experience some different growth if you want her to.

One thing to consider about Lizzy's arc is that *her* lessons in pride and judgment aren't really the focus of the story anymore. Unless we give her a father's sin to overcome too, which seems a bit like overkill, it might be appropriate to spend a little less time in Lizzy's point of view and spend a little more time on the gentlemen's side of the story, since they're the ones experiencing vastly different and important character arcs because of the changes introduced to the storyline.

An aspect of Lizzy's character that took me a bit by surprise in this story was all the sexual tension and forwardness in the last third of the book. I'm sure it's common for *Pride and Prejudice* variations to get a little steamy sometimes, and I also totally understand that that's what some readers really look forward to most. (Who doesn't like a little steam once in a while?) However, to me, the intimate aspects of Lizzy's falling in love with Darcy seemed like a way to spice up the parts of the plot that were turning out a lot like the original book. This isn't necessarily to criticize including sexual tension itself, but I think it would be more satisfying for more readers if it wasn't just there to make the "boring" parts more exciting. But if you make the kinds of changes I've suggested earlier for Lizzy, then this probably won't be such an issue. I'll talk about this a little more in the section on tone as well.

Minor Characters

I just have a few things to add about some of the minor characters being underdeveloped in some aspects.

Mr. Bennet

I really loved seeing Mr. Bennet be so much more involved with raising his family in the early chapters of the story, but I couldn't help wondering what prompted him to be a different father in this story. I have to assume that somehow Collins touched his heart and influenced him to be more involved, but I would have loved to see more of *how* Collins influenced Mr. Bennet. (This

goes along with the idea that we didn't get to see enough of Collins growing up with the Bennets and developing relationships with them.)

One more thing about Mr. Bennet is that the scene when he questioned Darcy about marrying Lizzy seemed a little . . . off. He seemed to give in a little too much to the idea that he was being forced to say yes to them for the sake of appearances and not actually demanding more understanding about whether Lizzy and Darcy really loved each other.

Dean Stokes

The dean of Collins' university only appears briefly in Chapter 4, but even in that brief time it stood out to me that he had very little personality. We don't expect minor characters like this to have their own arc or become a fan favorite, but they can be so useful in helping emerse the readers further into the world of the story when given a little more individuality. Think about how the dean's interactions with Collins could reveal some of his character. Maybe he's proud or vain or impatient or inattentive. . . . Traits like this can be conveyed in surprisingly few words. And these small character details can also help show readers how Collins feels about going to Oxford and how he's adjusting to the transition.

Mrs. Gardiner

In Chapter 12, Mrs. Gardiner asks Lizzy all about how the relationship between Jane and Bingley is going. I know you were trying to make her the loving aunt who anyone can confide in, but it seemed so forward of her to ask about it. I think I'd believe and be okay with the conversation more if Lizzy sought out her aunt for encouragement and advice first. Otherwise, it almost seems like Mrs. Gardiner is becoming a gossiper.

Stanley

I thought Stanley seemed like a great side character when Collins met him at university. It was almost disappointing that I didn't get to see him develop a relationship with Collins more. However, when he appeared again in Chapter 13 as Charlotte's husband, I realized he was suddenly exactly like Collins was in the original story. While I'm sure it was meant more in humor than anything else, Stanley's character felt more like a cheap move. He was only around to replace the old Collins and was completely unoriginal. More than that, I felt like he was actually someone different than who I'd seen in Chapter 4 interacting with Collins at Oxford. Again, he's a minor character, so he doesn't need a whole character arc to himself, but I think a little more individuality and less copying of the original Collins would make him more appealing.

Themes

In your first book, *Behind the Mask*, I thought you had some very clear themes that came out throughout the whole book. However, in *The Sins of Their Fathers*, it feels like you identified a theme in the beginning and had a little fun with it, forgot about it for the majority of the book while Lizzy and Darcy got together, and then mentioned it again at the end to try to make it look

like you hadn't forgotten about it. I've already talked about some reasons for this. We don't get enough time with characters like Collins, Wickham, and Bingley overcoming the trauma brought on by their fathers. And although we got plenty of time with Darcy, none of it was really about him becoming someone better despite what his father had done in the past. We also got lots and lots of time with Lizzy, who didn't have anything to really overcome as far as trauma or a poor father figure was concerned.

I'm all for Darcy and Lizzy still getting together in this story! But I think your desire to plug in some of the iconic scenes and situations from the original novel have taken over your ability to have a conversation with the reader about this theme. Maybe Lizzy doesn't have to hate Darcy and reject his proposal and then get a letter from him and see that he's been a true hero in the background all this time in order to have a good love story with him—at least, maybe not for this story, depending on what Darcy needs to learn about overcoming his father's previous mistakes. Maybe he needs to learn what actually overcoming those mistakes means. Is it avoiding the exact same choices someone else made, or does it have to do more with identifying principles that should guide you in your own life's circumstances?

Each of our four main gentlemen (and our lovely Miss Caroline Bingley) can have so much to discover about getting through trauma, accepting it, healing from it, and moving on to be and do better. The love stories don't have to get lost along the way, but they shouldn't get in the way of the themes developing, either.

If you feel like you need a little help developing these themes you've established in the beginning of your story, you're welcome to arrange a consultation call with me so I can brainstorm with you or just be a sounding board for your ideas. I'm sure you'll have lots of great ideas, though, and I can't wait to see what you come up with!

Final Thoughts

I know this is a lot of information to shift through! Hopefully the way I've organized it will help you feel confident in applying these suggestions the way you want to. Again, if you feel like you need a little help brainstorming specific ways to develop aspects of your story, you're welcome to reach out to me for a consultation session!

Thank you so much for trusting me with your manuscript! I can't wait to see how this story develops from here.

Sincerely,

Brillany